

PHIL 355 Handout
 Norcross, 1/23/20
 GSI: Sumeet Patwardhan

Exercise One: Practicing ‘Working Backwards’

Here’s an example of ‘working backwards’ to reconstruct Norcross’s argument.

<u>Argument</u>	<u>Objection</u>
P1: The behavior of those who buy and eat Chocolate Mousse a la Bama is wrong.	
P2: The behavior of those who buy and eat Chocolate Mousse a la Bama and the behavior of those who eat factory-farmed meat is morally equivalent.	The behavior of those who buy and eat Chocolate Mousse a la Bama and the behavior of those who buy and eat factory-farmed meat is not morally equivalent.
C1: The behavior of those who buy and eat factory-farmed meat is wrong.	

Below, I've given you the conclusion of a totally different argument, and an objection to P2 of that argument. Using this information, do the following:

1. First, find P2. (Remember, the objection should be a direct response to P2.)
2. Once you find P2, find P1. (Remember that P1, P2, and C1 should form a valid argument.)

<u>Argument</u>	<u>Objection</u>
P1:	
P2:	The behavior of those who buy and eat factory-farm meat and the behavior of those who buy and eat factory-farm animal products is not morally equivalent.
C1: The behavior of those who buy and eat factory-farm animal products is wrong.	

Exercise Two: Distinguishing Objections

What are some of the objections to P1 and P2 that Norcross considers?

Exercise Three: Preparation for Discussion

Which objection or objections do you find compelling, if any? If you don't find any of them compelling, which do you think could potentially be made compelling by strengthening the objection in some way? (To put it more concretely – if you will not give up eating factory-farmed meat, why won't you? What do you think justifies that decision?)

Are there any morally relevant differences between Fred's behavior and meat-eaters' behavior that Norcross did not consider?

Feedback

What went well in section this week? (In other words, what was productive for your learning or engagement?)

What could have gone better?